Annual Report January 2012 to December 2012

Praja Foundation



Simplifying peoples' lives

www.praja.org

Address: Room no.5, 2nd Floor, Botawala Building, 11/13, Horniman Circle, Fort, Mumbai – 400 023, India

Praja Report – January 2012 to December 2012

I. Executive Summary

In year 2012, Praja released four white papers and MLA report card that provided rich analysis on citizen issues and workings of elected representatives. All of them were widely covered by print and electronic media.

Elections for the Mumbai Corporation were held in February 2012 in which 50% seats had women reservations. When an analysis was done of those 227 elected members, it was found that almost 60% of those elected were first time councillors, who had no training or exposure to the workings of the corporation. Praja launched a programme to fill this lacunae and we have not only produced two volumes of a handy guide for the councillors for understanding the workings of the corporation and their roles but have also been arranging contact programmes with domain experts to provide an opportunity for the councillors to clear their doubts and hone their skills.

We found that the Report Cards did influence Citizens of Mumbai and Political Leaders in the MCGM Elections. Constant media communication has played a tremendous role in making people aware of ground realities including making the administration and elected representatives take note of the problems at the ward level and act on them.

This year we also tried to engage colleges and educational institutes in making students aware about accountable governance. We had volunteers from SNDT, NMIMS and Somiaya College to whom we exposed the concepts of making governance accountable through our workshops and through 'live' projects.

After Praja's health white paper was launched, we arranged a Round Table on 'Strengthening Health MIS' attended by councillors, retired officials, public health department representatives and health experts from the development sector – the recommendations were shared with all the stakeholders. We also met the Commissioner of Police for changes to be introduced and discussed at length our report on the state of police in the city. The Municipal Commissioner also invited us to discuss about Praja's involvement in helping to plan out a study on citizen satisfaction with services of the corporation.

II. Data Collection and Data Management

Data Collection and Management remains the backbone of our project. We have been looking to improve richness of the data that we collect. We updated our process document to be more focused and have least mistakes. We would come out with a professional process consultancy "Tool Box" for the same. We added new data of budget and personnel for education and health also Medical Officer School, scholarship, SSC pass out for education and annual administrative report for crime data.

Along with the survey for the MLA Report card, we had asked the research agency to also conduct a primary survey on the status of health, education and crime. The data collated, provided further insights in the issues affecting Mumbaikars. For example more than 3.9 lakh people of Mumbai suffered from malaria in 2011, more than 85% of the students take tuition, and many more similar nuggets of data.

III. Publications – White Paper, Report Card, Newsletters

- **1.** Mumbai Agenda White Paper: This white paper presented an analysis on the ward wise citizen's issues, for the new councillors of MCGM.
- 2. MLA Report Card 2012:



This was the second year launch of the Annual Report card of the MLA's, which gives a ranking to Mumbai's MLA's. It was launched in June 2012. We received good press coverage and the MLA who stood second came to meet us and discuss the report as well. We have sent 5500 copies all over India to MLAs, MPs, NGOs and administrators. We received a call from the Bihar government to let them know more about the matrix of the Report card, so that they can also consider a similar project for the Bihar MLAs.

Attached Annexure 2 – MLA Report Card 2012



3. Health White Paper :

The status of Health of Mumbai was launched on the 24th of July 2012 at Press club. This time it had two sections, one was the data collected in four years through RTI and another was the Survey conducted by Hansa research agency on health issues. This paper made a big impact, as we got very good coverage this time for the health report as well as the success as evident from the fact that the MCGM had to come up with a counter Press conference because of our Report. Many councillors and heath committee members called us to understand the report. We also received a call from Mr. Jayant Patil Guardian Minister of Maharashtra, to discuss the report.

Attached Annexure 3 – Health White Paper

4. Crime White Paper:

* THE TIMES OF INDIA, MUMBAI WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 5, 2012 TIMES CITY Mumbai's wild west: Bandra. Kurla. Vile Parle city's most unsafe areas



37

28 28

40 41

31 33 34 34

32

Few criminal cases reach trial stage ling on the police

6.378 6,271

Sharp rise in rapes, molestations in 4 yrs 66

Wor

73

CCIDENTS VEHICLES STOLEN

en's rights activist

White Paper on the state of crime raises several crucial issues that need to be debated and deliberated upon to bring about significant policy changes to prevent the ever deteriorating law and order situation in the city of Mumbai. Our papers are full of news about grisly crimes committed against senior citizens. Punishment is the biggest deterrent to serious crimes. And in our democratic processes, punishment is solely dependent nogu framing of charges, investigation, trial and then conviction. This is where the state and the police need a serious rethink. As our data shows, while the law and order situation has remained more or less at the same level for the past couple of years, investigation, solving of crime, trial and conviction for heinous crimes still leave a lot to be desired. The general trend over the last four years is that crime rate has more or less stabilised in the city at the current level. However, certain specific crimes such as Rape, Molestation, Accidents and Vehicle Stolen are growing consistently, in fact we found that road accidents have almost doubled over the past few years.

Attached Annexure 4 –Crime White Paper

08 | metro | hindustantimes wednesday, december 19, 2012

Civic body's high spending on students yields no results

POOR Private school students fare better academically despite fees being less than what BMC spends

dha Variyar

tate of affairs in

EXPENDITURE NOT TRANSLATING INTO PERFORMANCE QUESTIONS ASKED BY While the BMC spends more than Rs50,000 per student annually, the fees in private unaided schools range from Rs15,000 to Rs36,000 68 questions on education in 325 SSC RESULTS Civic Private Civic Civic Private 1,64,537 7,623 1.36.187

5. Education White Paper :

Praja's Education White Paper titled: 'Status of Municipal Education in Mumbai' was released in December 2012. It raised very pertinent issues that are crippling the public (municipal) education system in Mumbai. Despite the corporation spending more than Rs.50,000/- an each student, comparison of performances of MCGM school students and those of the private school students, where the fees even in better schools range in between Rs.15,000/- and Rs.36,000/-, draws a dismissal contrast: In the past 4 years (2009-2012), the average percentage of students passing SSC from private schools is 82% while the average

passing students from municipal schools has been mere 58%. Out of the 100 students who received Government of India scholarship in Class IV, only 9 were from corporation schools. Another scholarship scheme by Government of India for Class VII students had only 2 students from corporation schools out of 100 students. These were the few key findings this white paper came out with. The media gave us a very good response for the report.

Attached Annexure 5 – Education White Paper

6. Municipal Councillor Handbook vol 1 and vol 2:



These handbooks that we at Praja have put together are a collection of important facts that can assist councillors to do all that is possible to be done to make Mumbai a better city; to line in these books we tried to put together a toolkit that the councillors could refer during their tenure.

Volume 1 covered: A Background of MCGM; Overview of Mumbai Municipal Corporation Act, 1888; Introduction to Municipal Budgeting; Planning Principles for Development plan; Introduction to Praja; and Praja's Report Card.

While Volume 2 covered the following issues: Become an effective legislator – the key to it lies in a clear understanding and apt use of the **Corporation Procedure Rules** and the devices to raise issues; Allocating Resources – through appropriate **budgetary allocations and**

monitoring its right usage; and Envisaging the future needs and providing for those – through open, equitable and efficient **Development Planning**.

Attached Annexure 6 –Municipal Councillor Handbook vol 1 and vol 2

IV. Dissemination and Outreach

1. Website and SMO

- a. A new Resource page Link has been created on the Praja website.
- b. An back end has been created to upload ward level details which will have more details and can be used as a ward resource for anyone who will need information on the administrative wards of Mumbai.
- c. An independent reporting system has been developed where the media, researchers, social activists and citizens, in general can view the functions of elected representatives, compare details, view averages etc. which is going to be live from January month.
- d. The Praja page and group on Facebook are actively accessed by Citizens. All the press Coverage's and Monthly Newsletters have been shared regularly on Facebook.
- e. We have had 30,535 visits and 23,083 Unique Visitors to Praja website from Jan to December 2012 at www.praja.org
- f. We have started tracking the downloads of our different products on our website. We have found a total of 4617 downloads for year 2012.

2. Newsletter

During all our interactions with the elected representatives and administrative officers we have found an appreciation of the analysis given by Praja. We receive calls from elected representatives and officers enquiring about our next newsletter release. The media has started referring to our data analysis regularly for various articles (as a fact they download our data and print directly while crediting the data to Praja). We reach out to over 13000+ people through our Newsletters. The target audience of the newsletter are:

- Government (Municipal and State)
- Elected Representatives Mumbai Councillors, MLAs from Mumbai and MPs from Mumbai
- Administration includes MCGM officials, Police administration in Mumbai and key officials in the state administration
- Praja Members (registered on the website)
- Selected database of NGOs and civil society activists in the city

The English version of the newsletter is emailed to everyone in the above mentioned group and the Marathi version is printed and couriered to the first three categories above, viz. Government, Elected Representatives and Administration. From January we have also started to printing English Newsletters.

Attached Annexure 7 – Newsletter

3. Health Round Table: November 2012

Our Health Paper had raised red flags on the city's public health system, particularly the inadequate Health MIS and to follow it up we organised a Round Table. The discussion, attended by a close group of Elected Representatives from Public Health Committee, Public Health Officials (present & past), PSM (Preventive & Social Medicine) Heads of Medical Colleges and representatives of different health organisations, focused on the importance of data in formulating healthcare policies for the city and the state. MCGM representatives explained in detail how the Corporation too is keen on gathering data on healthcare from all parts of the city. However, data from the non-government healthcare segment that is visited by almost 75% of the city's population was difficult to come by. The Round Table discussion strongly recommended legislative acts and punitive action for access to crucial public health information from non-government healthcare sector. This round table was one of its first where the key stakeholders were represented and debated openly about a problem that till recently was not even recognised until our white paper raised it.



Standing L-R: Dr. Dipesh Reddy (Public Health Professional); Milind Mhaske (Project Director, Praja Foundation); Dr.Jayant Khandare (Assistant Health Officer Epidemiology Cell, MCGM); Shekhar Ghosh (PR Professional); Nitai Mehta (Managing Trustee, Praja Foundation); Dr. Ram Barot (Councillor, Public Health Committee Member); Dr.R.M. Chaturvedi (Prof. and Head, P.S.M, L.T. Hospital); Anirvan Chatterjee (The Foundation for Medical Research); Dr.Mangesh Pednekar (Director, Dev.

and Research, Healis); Bhavesh Mansinghani (Research Director, Hansa Research); Nachiket Sule (FRCH); Mr. Anajan Kumar Ghosh (Senior Vice President Hansa Research); Mr. Oommen C.K (Sr. Research officer, Cehat).Seating L-R : Priyanka Sharma (Project Manager, Praja Foundation); Leni Chaudhari (Prog. Manager, Narrotam Sakhsaria Foundation); Dr. Santosh Revankar (Deputy Executive Health Officer, MCGM); Sulabha Pathak (Researcher, TIFR); D M Sukhtankar (Ex. Municipal commissioner, Mumbai and Chief Secretary, Government of Maharashtra); Dr.Neera Kewalramani (Ex. Deputy Health Officer); Dr. (Mrs) S.V. Akarte, (Professor and Head Preventive and social Medicine, JJ hospital)

Attached Annexure 8 – Health Round Table

4. Elected Representative Meetings

As our Project is ER Centric; we meet Councillors and MLAs on a regular basis. Sometimes we are also invited by them for an understanding of our Data and issues. This year we have interacted with 187 (belonging to 23 out of 24 wards) councillors and six MLAs of Mumbai. **Total – 193** plus political party leaders from BJP, MNS, INC and we additionally reach out to them with our different Reports and Monthly Newsletters.

We are more focused on the ER interaction as we are having the training of the New Councillors and also meeting the Committee chair persons to introduce Praja as well as the issues relating to their purview.

Attached Annexure 9 – Elected Representative Meetings

5. Workshops for Councillors:

Most elected councillors learn the ropes within the BMC through trial and error. The Laws and Acts at the BMC are voluminous, to say the least. There are multiple departments and committees, each having their own set of rules and regulations enough to confuse an Elected Representative. As a result, most councillors are silent observers of proceedings or seek



guidance from their colleagues and administration executives. They have little understanding of their responsibilities and are unaware of how to effectively use their powers. Precisely for this reason Praja has come out with handbooks for the councillors on the nuances of their role, act, rules, etc. and is also conducting continuous trainings/workshops for them to understand their roles and the tools better.

6. Praja's Interaction with Media:

For the media Praja has now become a one point source for authenticated, non-partisan information on Civic, Crime, Education and Health issues in the city and information on the role of Elected Representatives in solving these issues. During the year there have been number of instances when not only did the media source information directly from Praja but also quoted our research in various media reports. Journalists have now routinely started calling us to check authenticity of statements made by the administration on issues and to understand the opinion of Praja on the particular issue. Total of **167** print media and **28** of Audio visual print media and **40** Internet therefore, a total of **235** media mentions were given to Praja throughout the Year. This year Praja was covered on Front page: **24** times and on the second page: **28** times highlighting the importance of our finding data.

7. Praja's Interaction with Civil Society Organisations (CSOs):

During the year we have been associated with the UDRI (Urban Design Research Institute) in conducting a public participation planning process for the Development Plan of Greater Mumbai 2014-34. For the health paper we linked up with the Healis Sekhsaria Institute for Public Health for understanding the technicalities of the issue. NBF' (Namma Bengaluru) Bengaluru is one of the organisations who have reached us to replicate the Report card for the MLAs in their cities. We had various levels of discussions with 20 organisations during the year.

We were also called to present papers, and speak at several workshops and seminars.

Interactions with College Students: Interaction with colleges and Institutes is one of the key areas of CSO interaction. We have volunteers from colleges to help us in our daily activities and also have research based project with colleges. We have had on-going programmes with 4 institutions in the city during this period.

Attached Annexure 10 – Praja's Interaction with Civil Society Organisations

8. Interaction with the Administration:

The team had meetings on several occasions with different key officials to share Praja analysis including the Chief Secretary, Police Commissioner, Principal Secretary to the CM and many other officials. The administration at various levels right from the Municipal Commissioner, Chief Secretary, Police Commissioner to the Ward Officers, Police Inspectors, all are not only aware of Praja as an organisation which monitors the state of the city but also someone which dialogues with the key stakeholders to create solutions for better governance.

9. Launch of *CityScan* – October 2012:

Praja launched an online tool for generating reports on the data Praja has. It is called CityScan, and a link of which has been placed in the Home page of the website. It is an online collation of data on civic and security issues about Mumbai ranging from health, education, water, roads to crime and role of city's guardians. It compiles data about the city collected through RTI on several civic issues affecting the governance of the city of Mumbai. For instance, if you want to know the status of crime in Mumbai, CityScan[©] can provide you with a ward-wise break up of different kinds of crime committed over the past five years.

Attached Annexure 11 – Launch of CityScan – October 2012

10. Thane Feasibility study: November 2012

Praja foundation is concentrating on governance issues in Mumbai Municipal Corporation. We have been working with administration staff members and elected representatives and have greater understanding of Municipal Corporation. But we have limited understanding and information about three tier system of Panchayati Raj and hence we wanted to see if we could replicate our Praja Dialogue with other systems. The feasibility study was completed during the period October to November 2012. The study will help us to understand the working of other Corporations, Panchayat Samitis, Councils and Village Panchayats. The key conclusion that we have drawn is that 'Dialogue' is the missing link in today's context of governance and a platform like 'Praja Dialogue' can be replicated in other regions of the country as governance is at the end enabled by its end consumers, implementers and governors and they can enable governance only when they *Dialogue* on the need, find solutions, monitor the implementation and take corrective action.

Attached Annexure 12 –Thane Feasibility Study